

Legislative Assembly Province of Alberta

No. 24

# **VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

Fourth Session

Twenty-Fourth Legislature

Thursday, April 6, 2000

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

# **Presenting Petitions**

Mrs. O'Neill, Hon. Member for St. Albert, presented a petition from 20 St. Albert and Morinville residents requesting that Regional Health Authorities be allowed to contract out surgical services.

Mr. Langevin, Hon. Member for Lac La Biche-St. Paul, presented a petition from 41 Plamondon and Lac La Biche residents requesting the introduction of a Bill banning the establishment of private for-profit hospitals in Alberta to maintain the integrity of the public, universal health care system.

Mr. Broda, Hon. Member for Redwater, presented a petition from 20 Albertans requesting that Regional Health Authorities be allowed to contract out surgical services.

Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, presented a petition from 252 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, presented a petition from 254 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry, presented a petition from 408 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 302 Albertans requesting the introduction of a bill banning the establishment of private forprofit hospitals in Alberta to maintain the integrity of the public, universal health care system.

### **Reading and Receiving Petitions**

On request by Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Calder, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.



On request by Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of the Province of Alberta, hereby petition the Legislative Assembly to pass a bill banning private for-profit hospitals in Alberta so that the integrity of the public, universal health care system may be maintained.

On request by Mrs. O'Neill, Hon. Member for St. Albert, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to provide respective Regional Health Authorities with the flexibility necessary to provide the delivery of publicly funded, publicly administered overnight surgical services cost-effectively and efficiently through the contracting-out of such services if deemed necessary.

On request by Mrs. O'Neill, Hon. Member for St. Albert, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to provide respective Regional Health Authorities with the flexibility necessary to provide the delivery of publicly funded, publicly administered overnight surgical services cost-effectively and efficiently through the contracting-out of such services if deemed necessary.

#### **Notice of Motions**

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, gave oral notice of his intention to move the following motion under Standing Order 40:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly urge the Government to respect the right of journalists to freely join trade unions and to condemn any infringement of this basic human right.



#### **Tabling Returns and Reports**

Hon. Ms Evans, Minister of Children's Services:

Responses to questions raised on March 20, 2000, Department of Children's Services, 2000-2001 Designated Supply Subcommittee consideration

Sessional Paper 521/2000

Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness on behalf of the Hon. Mrs. McClellan, Minister of International and Intergovernmental Relations:

Letter dated April 6, 2000, from Hon. Mrs. McClellan, Minister of International and Intergovernmental Relations, and Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, to the Hon. Allan Rock, Federal Minister of Health, regarding the potential implications of Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act in relation to NAFTA (North American Free Trade Agreement), an attached legal opinion dated March 23, 2000, in relation to the same issue, prepared by Shawna Vogel, Cruickshank Karvellas, Barristers and Solicitors, and an Alberta International and Intergovernmental Relations news release dated April 4, 2000, entitled "No NAFTA implications for Bill 11"

Sessional Paper 522/2000

Document dated April 5, 2000, entitled "Inter-provincial Survey of Private Surgical Facilities" setting out details of legislation governing private surgical facilities in each province

Sessional Paper 523/2000

Hon. Mr. Dunford, Minister of Human Resources and Employment:

Responses to questions raised on March 13, 2000, Department of Human Resources and Employment, 2000-2001 Designated Supply Subcommittee consideration

Sessional Paper 524/2000

Mrs. Laing, Hon. Member for Calgary-Bow:

Declaration of Arbroath - Scottish Declaration of Independence of April 6, 1320 Sessional Paper 525/2000

Hon. Mr. Stelmach, Minister of Infrastructure:

Response to Written Question WQ10 asked for by Mr. Wickman on behalf of Mrs. Soetaert on April 5, 2000:

How much has the Government saved each year from 1996-97 to 1998-99 as a result of contracting out highway maintenance and on what evidence are the figures based?

Sessional Paper 526/2000

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark:

News release dated April 5, 2000, entitled "Alberta NAFTA (North American Free Trade Agreement) opinion says a lot of nothing" prepared by CUPE (Canadian Union of Public Employees) Communications, and report dated April 5, 2000, entitled "A whole lot of nothing: Alberta's NAFTA (North American Free Trade Agreement) legal opinion" prepared by Steven Shrybman

Sessional Paper 527/2000

Letter dated March 31, 2000, from Walley J. Temple, M.D., F.R.C.S.C., F.A.C.S., Professor of Surgery and Oncology, University of Calgary, expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 528/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

Edmonton Journal article dated April 6, 2000, entitled "Klein critical of journalists' labour disputes"

Sessional Paper 529/2000

News release dated April 5, 2000, entitled "Alberta NAFTA (North American Free Trade Agreement) opinion says a lot of nothing" prepared by CUPE (Canadian Union of Public Employees) Communications, and report dated April 5, 2000, entitled "A whole lot of nothing: Alberta's NAFTA (North American Free Trade Agreement) legal opinion" prepared by Steven Shrybman

Sessional Paper 530/2000

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie,:

3 letters from Jill Briscoe and Jeffrey A. Anthony, both of Canmore, and Dave Sutherland of Lac Des Arcs, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing opposition to the development of the Spray Lakes area by the Genesis Land Corporation Sessional Paper 531/2000

Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods:

Postcard documenting the occupation and education of Hon. Dr. Oberg, Minister of Learning

Sessional Paper 532/2000

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre:

Resolution #4 of the Alberta Public Health Association entitled "Women's Organizations", approved May 7, 1999

Sessional Paper 533/2000

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar:

Letter, undated, from Thérèse Beaudoin, Edmonton, to Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, expressing opposition to the proposal to allow Regional Health Authorities to enter into contracts with private for-profit hospitals Sessional Paper 534/2000

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora:

Letter dated April 4, 2000, from Kenneth L. Smith, Edmonton, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding the Government's proposal to remove Alberta from the Canada Pension Plan and implement a Provincial Government Pension Plan

Sessional Paper 535/2000

Letter dated February 1, 2000, from Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, to Hon. Mr. Hancock, Minister of Justice and Attorney General, letter dated February 25, 2000, from Hon. Mr. Hancock, Minister of Justice and Attorney General, to Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, and an e-mail message dated March 31, 2000, to Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, regarding the visitation policy for inmates at young offenders facilities

Sessional Paper 536/2000

Letter dated May 19, 1994, from Nader Ghermezian, to a former Minister of Economic Development and Tourism regarding the financing arrangements of the West Edmonton Mall

Sessional Paper 537/2000

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo:

2 documents entitled "Historical Consolidated Fiscal Summary, 1983-84 to 2002-03" relating to provincial health care expenditures, and "Current Economic Indicators" setting out consumer price index comparisons in Alberta, Calgary, Edmonton, Canada, and the United States

Sessional Paper 538/2000

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview:

Letter dated January 17, 2000, from Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, to Scott Sutton, Provincial Ombudsman, requesting a review and investigation of the current inaccessibility of our public health care system Sessional Paper 539/2000

Sessional Paper 559/2000

Poster advertising medicare rallies to be held at the Corral Round-up Centre, Calgary, on April 15, 2000, and at the Agricom, Edmonton on April 16, 2000 Sessional Paper 540/2000

# **Members' Statements**

Ms Graham, Hon. Member for Calgary-Lougheed, made a statement regarding Tartan Day, April 6, 2000, which recognizes the tartan as a symbol of Scottish clans and commemorates the signing of the declaration of independence at Arbroath on April 6, 1320.

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, made a statement regarding Tartan Day, April 6, 2000, which celebrates Scottish heritage and commemorates the signing of the declaration of independence at Arbroath on April 6, 1320.

Mrs. Burgener, Hon. Member for Calgary-Currie, made a statement regarding a community initiative in Calgary by the Citizens Round Table concerning the development of affordable housing on CFB (Canadian Forces Base) Calgary land.

# **Projected Government Business**

Pursuant to Standing Order 7(5), Mrs. Sloan, Acting Official Opposition House Leader, asked a question pertaining to the order of Government Business to be brought before the Assembly for the following week.

Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, gave notice of projected Government Business for the week of April 10 to April 14, 2000:

Monday, April 10	Aft.	- Government Bills and Orders
		Second Reading
		Bill 7, 14, 15, 16, 17, 11
		And as per Order Paper
	Eve.	- Government Bills and Orders
		Second Reading
		Bill 11, 3, 13
		And as per Order Paper
Tuesday, April 11	(4:30)	- Private Bills
		Second Reading/Committee of the Whole
		Bill 20, 22, 23, 11
		And as per Order Paper

	Eve	<b>Government Bills and Orders</b>
		Second Reading/Committee of the Whole
		Bill 11, 18, 19, 20
		And as per Order Paper
Wednesday, April 12	Eve	<b>Government Bills and Orders</b>
		Committee of the Whole
		Bill 10, 11
		And as per Order Paper
Thursday, April 13	Aft	<b>Government Bills and Orders</b>
		Committee of the Whole
		Bill 21, 11
		And as per Order Paper

# **Motions Under Standing Order 40**

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, requested the unanimous consent of the Assembly for consideration of the following motion:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly urge the Government to respect the right of journalists to freely join trade unions and to condemn any infringement of this basic human right.

Unanimous consent to proceed was not granted.

# **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

# **Government Bills and Orders**

#### Second Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 21 Appropriation Act, 2000 (\$) — Hon. Dr. West on behalf of Hon. Mr. Day

A debate followed.

Hon. Mr. Hancock moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act - Hon. Mr. Klein on behalf of Hon. Mr. Jonson

A debate followed.

Pursuant to Standing Order 61(3), at 5:15 p.m. the Deputy Speaker immediately put the question on the Appropriation Bill standing on the Order Paper for Second Reading, which was agreed to.

The following Bill was read a Second time and referred to Committee of the Whole:

Bill 21 Appropriation Act, 2000 (\$) — Hon. Dr. West on behalf of Hon. Mr. Day

Debate resumed on the motion for Second Reading of Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act.

Mr. MacDonald moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

#### Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 5:29 p.m. until Monday, April 10, 2000, at 1:30 p.m.

Hon. Ken Kowalski, Speaker

Title: Thursday, April 6, 2000